
Handbook of Argumentation Theory

Frans H. van Eemeren
Bart Garssen • Erik C. W. Krabbe
A. Francisca Snoeck Henkemans
Bart Verheij • Jean H. M. Wagemans

Handbook of Argumentation Theory

With 78 Figures and 1 Table



Springer Reference

Frans H. van Eemeren
Faculty of Humanities
University of Amsterdam
Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Bart Garssen
Faculty of Humanities
University of Amsterdam
Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Erik C. W. Krabbe
Faculty of Philosophy
University of Groningen
Groningen, The Netherlands

A. Francisca Snoeck Henkemans
Faculty of Humanities
University of Amsterdam
Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Bart Verheij
Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences
University of Groningen
Groningen, The Netherlands

Jean H. M. Wagemans
Faculty of Humanities
University of Amsterdam
Amsterdam, The Netherlands

ISBN 978-90-481-9472-8 ISBN 978-90-481-9473-5 (eBook)
ISBN 978-90-481-9474-2 (print and electronic bundle)
DOI 10.1007/978-90-481-9473-5
Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg New York London

Library of Congress Control Number: 2014939853

© Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht 2014

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed. Exempted from this legal reservation are brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis or material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the Copyright Law of the Publisher's location, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Permissions for use may be obtained through RightsLink at the Copyright Clearance Center. Violations are liable to prosecution under the respective Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

While the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication, neither the authors nor the editors nor the publisher can accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made. The publisher makes no warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

Preface

When Springer Academic invited me in 2008 to write a handbook of argumentation theory, I realized two things immediately – first, that the time was indeed ripe for publishing a new overview of the state of the art in argumentation theory, and second, that it would be wise to carry out this project with a small group of competent authors who could easily work together. Both considerations were based on my experience with these kinds of projects.

As far as I am concerned, the history of the present project starts in the early 1970s, when I set off writing the first handbook of argumentation theory with Rob Grootendorst and Tjark Kruiger. The resulting overview of the state of the art, published in 1978 in Dutch as *Argumentatietheorie*, was already in 1981 followed by a second, considerably enlarged edition. English translations of this handbook were published in 1984 and 1987 by two different publishers. To do justice to the rapid developments in the field, in the early 1990s I thought it necessary to prepare a new, updated overview. I invited a group of internationally prominent argumentation scholars to join me. The study we coauthored, *Fundamentals of Argumentation Theory*, was published in 1996.

During the past two decades, argumentation theory has further matured as a discipline and the number of publications devoted to argumentation has grown considerably. Neoclassical theoretical approaches to argumentation, such as the Toulmin model and the New Rhetoric, have inspired new developments. In addition, prominent approaches of a more recent date, such as Informal Logic and Pragma-Dialectics, have expanded in various ways. Meanwhile, Formal Dialectic and other formal approaches have also been pursued further. Promising connections between argumentation theory and artificial intelligence have been established. Moreover, important new approaches have come into being, sometimes inspired by disciplines distinct from, but related to, argumentation theory. Another striking and noteworthy development is that the theoretical interest in argumentation has now spread worldwide.

It is clear that, 20 years after the completion of the manuscript for the previous overview, it is high time for a grand update. To make this happen, I have invited five Dutch colleagues to coauthor the new *Handbook of Argumentation Theory* with me: Bart Garssen, Erik C. W. Krabbe, A. Francisca Snoeck Henkemans, Bart Verheij, and Jean H. M. Wagemans. All of them are active argumentation scholars with the required kind of expertise. They have experience with carrying out joint writing

projects, with other authors as well as with each other. As we all live in The Netherlands, we could easily meet whenever it was needed. It was decided from the start that the authors would be together responsible for the entire text of the handbook. Although there was, of course, a certain division of labor, this shared authorship was from the beginning reflected in the working process. The first drafts of some chapters were written by two or more authors, and in all cases several other members of the team contributed to the revision of the texts.

In the *Handbook of Argumentation Theory*, we have tried to do justice to the broadness of the field and the existing variety in the theoretical approaches that are pursued. Hence, it goes without saying that for all topics we were dealing with, we needed profound and serious feedback from several specialists in the field. For that purpose, a board of editors was formed, consisting of scholars who are leading experts in the topics discussed and the theoretical approaches described. As we had hoped and expected, the members of the board have commented critically and precisely on earlier versions of all chapters of the handbook. The argumentation scholars who served as members of the board are mentioned in the Acknowledgment section, together with their affiliations and the chapters they reviewed. Without their invaluable assistance, the overview presented in this volume could certainly not have been given. On behalf of all authors, I want to emphasize that we are most grateful for their constructive comments and criticisms.

Another kind of indispensable help has come from prominent argumentation scholars in non-Anglophone countries and from scholars from disciplines related to argumentation theory. They provided us with the material we needed in order to be able to describe the developments in the field. In addition, they also contributed greatly in improving these descriptions. Their assistance made it possible to add the last chapter to the handbook, in which the disciplinary and geographical broadening of argumentation theory is at issue. For this reason, their names and the sections they advised about are mentioned explicitly below – accompanied by an expression of our sincerest thanks to all of them.

Chapter 4: Lilian Bermejo-Luque (University of Granada) and Vincenzo Lo Cascio (University of Amsterdam)

Chapter 9: Thierry Herman (University of Neuchâtel and University of Lausanne) and Alaric Kohler (University of Neuchâtel and HEP-BEJUNE)

Chapter 11: Jacky Visser (University of Amsterdam), Charlotte Vlek (University of Groningen), and Sjoerd Timmer (Utrecht University)

Section 12.2: Isabela Fairclough (University of Central Lancashire), Norman Fairclough (University of Lancaster), and Constanza Ihnen Jory (University of Chile)

Section 12.3: Ademar Ferreira (University of São Paulo) and Gábor Á. Zemplén (Budapest University of Technology and Economics)

Section 12.4: Daniel O'Keefe (Northwestern University)

Section 12.5: Steve Oswald (University of Neuchâtel)

Section 12.6: Jes E. Kjeldsen (University of Bergen, Norway), Mika Hietanen (University of Uppsala), Juho Ritola (University of Turku), and Miika Marttunen (University of Jyväskylä)

Section 12.8: Henrike Jansen (Leiden University)

Section 12.9: Michel Dufour (Sorbonne Nouvelle Paris), Raphaël Michel (University of Lausanne), and Michel Meyer (Free University, Brussels)

Section 12.10: Sara Rubinelli (University of Lucerne and Swiss Paraplegic Research)

Section 12.11: Katarzyna Budzynska (Polish Academy of Sciences), Marcin Koszowy (University of Białystok), Igor Ź. Źagar (Educational Research Institute, Ljubljana and University of Primorska, Koper), Donka Alexandrova (Sofia University St. Kliment Ohridski), Anca Găță (Dunărea de Jos University of Galați), Gabrijela Kišiček (University of Zagreb), László I. Komlósi (University of Pécs), Gábor Zemplén (Budapest University of Technology and Economics), and Ana Dimiškovska (Ss. Cyril and Methodius University, Skopje)

Section 12.12: Lilit Brutian (Yerevan State University), Vadim Golubev (St. Petersburg State University), Kira Goudkova (St. Petersburg State University), Lev Vasilyev (Kaluga State University), Anatoliy Migunov (St. Petersburg State University), and Elena Lisanyuk (St. Petersburg State University)

Section 12.13: Cristián Santibáñez Yáñez (Universidad Diego Portales Santiago de Chile), Constanza Ihnen Jory (University of Chile), Fernando Leal (University of Guadalajara), and María Cristina Martínez (University of Valle)

Section 12.14: Henrique Jales Ribeiro (University of Coimbra), Dima Mohammed (New University of Lisbon), and Marcin Lewiński (New University of Lisbon)

Section 12.15: Galia Yanoshevsky (Bar-Ilan University)

Section 12.16: Dima Mohammed (New University of Lisbon) and Abdul Gabbar Al Sharafi (Sultan Qaboos University, Oman)

Section 12.17: Takeshi Suzuki (Meiji University, Tokyo)

Section 12.18: Minghui Xiong (Sun Yat-sen University, Guangzhou) and Yun Xie (Sun Yat-sen University, Guangzhou)

31 August 2013

Frans H. van Eemeren

Acknowledgments

The following members of the editorial board of the *Handbook of Argumentation Theory* have assisted the authors in a fundamental way in guarding the quality of the volume:

J. Anthony Blair, University of Windsor, Ontario: Chapters 1 and 7
Marianne Douy, CNRS, Paris: Chapter 9
Jeanne D. Fahnestock, University of Maryland: Chapter 5
Maurice Finocchiaro, University of Nevada at Las Vegas: Chapters 3 and 6
James Freeman, City University of New York: Chapter 4
Trudy Govier, University of Lethbridge, Alberta: Chapter 7
Hans V. Hansen, University of Windsor, Ontario: Chapter 7
Pieter Sjoerd Hasper, University of Indiana: Chapter 2
David Hitchcock, McMaster University: Chapters 4 and 6
Sally Jackson, University of Illinois at Urbana–Champaign: Chapter 10
Henrike Jansen, Leiden University: Chapter 10
Fred Kauffeld, Edgewood College, Madison: Chapter 8
Manfred Kienpointner, University of Innsbruck: Chapter 12
Manfred Kraus, University of Tübingen: Chapter 2
Daniel O’Keefe, Northwestern University: Chapter 8
Chris Reed, University of Dundee: Chapter 11
Agnès van Rees, University of Amsterdam: Chapters 3 and 10
Andrea Rocci, University of Lugano: Chapter 9
Guillermo Simari, Universidad Nacional del Sur, Bahía Blanca, Argentina:
Chapter 11
Christopher Tindale, University of Windsor, Ontario: Chapter 5
David Zarefsky, Northwestern University: Chapters 1, 4, and 8
Gábor Á. Zemplén, Budapest University of Technology and Economics:
Chapter 12

Contents

1 Argumentation Theory	1
2 Classical Backgrounds	51
3 Postclassical Backgrounds	141
4 Toulmin's Model of Argumentation	203
5 The New Rhetoric	257
6 Formal Dialectical Approaches	301
7 Informal Logic	373
8 Communication Studies and Rhetoric	425
9 Linguistic Approaches	479
10 The Pragma-Dialectical Theory of Argumentation	517
11 Argumentation and Artificial Intelligence	615
12 Research in Related Disciplines and Non-Anglophone Areas	677

Classified Bibliography	831
Alphabetical Bibliography	857
Index of Names	963
Index	979